



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



Approved Minutes

January 9, 2018, 8:30 a.m.
Committee Room, 2nd Floor, City Hall
101 City Hall Plaza, Durham, NC

I. Call to Order

Chair Fitzsimons called the meeting to order at 8:32 a.m.

II. Roll Call

Members Present:

Le'Andre Blakeney
Jonathan Dayan
Tad DeBerry
Joe Fitzsimons, Chair
Katie Hamilton
Joseph Jordan
Tom Kreger
Wanda Waiters

Excused Members Absent:

Staff Present:

Sara Young, Assistant Director
Grace Smith, Planning Supervisor
Karla Rosenberg, Planner
Terri Elliott, Planning
Don O'Toole, City Attorney's Office

III. Adjustments to the Agenda - None

IV. Approval of the Minutes

a. November 28, 2017 –

MOTION: Defer to approval of November meeting minutes. (Fitzsimons, Waiters 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 7–0 (Blakeney not yet present)

b. December 5, 2017 – Approved as modified.

MOTION: Approve 0 (Jordan/DeBerry 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 7–0 (Blakeney not yet present)

V. Swearing-In of Witnesses

Chair Fitzsimons read the opening HPC statement, and asked if there were any early dismissals required by Commission members or Commission members who might have a conflict of interest with the cases presented today. No conflicts of interest were noted, and no early dismissals were requested.

The Clerk to the Board administered the oath to all Citizens and staff who wished to speak at today's meeting.

VI. Certificates of Appropriateness

After the oath was given, Ms. Smith asked that all staff reports and materials submitted at the meeting be made part of the permanent record, including any needed additions, deletions, or corrections. All Commission members concurred.

a. **Case COA1700081 – 610 West Main Street / 602 West Morgan Street – Signs and Modifications – (Continued)** - (Hamilton, Blakeney Recused)

The applicant proposes to paint both exterior walls of an aerial walkway spanning between both landmark structures, and to install vinyl letters on the west-facing wall of the walkway. In addition, the applicant proposes to paint and install signage on a rooftop hopper. The Planning Director has determined the extent of proposed signage on the aerial walkway to be individual vinyl letters, and the extent of proposed signage on the rooftop hopper to be a circular aluminum panel. With newly substantiated evidence that the walkways and hopper were previously painted, the painting of these surfaces is considered regular maintenance, the content of which would be outside the Commission's area of consideration.

Staff Report: Ms. Smith presented the case and presented email dated 12/12/17 "West Village Painting Approval" as exhibit number one from staff. Ms. Smith made clarifications to the Review Criteria and Staff Analysis as to what was applicable.

Speakers: Mr. Pokela spoke in support. Mr. Emerson spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Pokela called witnesses to complete testimony (Ms. Smith, Planning Supervisor, Mr. DeWesse, Carrington Contracting, and Mr. Smith, McCorkle Sign Company) and presented 5 exhibits (35, 36, 37, 38 and 39) for the proposed project of – 610 West Main Street / 602 West Morgan Street – Signs and Modifications.

Commission Discussion: Discussion centered on the historic character of the landmark property, if the proposed signage is considered art, and if size and form of the signage is large enough to be seen as covering a significant portion.

Chair Fitzsimons closed public hearing for Commission discussion — The discussion focused on compatibility of the proposed signage with the historic character of the landmark property and whether or not the hopper and aerial walkway are considered significant architectural features. **Chair Fitzsimons reopened public hearing to receive additional evidence from staff and the applicant to hear response to Commission discussion** - Mr. Pokela made his closing statement and staff offered clarification on some of the criteria.

Chair Fitzsimons closed public hearing for further Commission discussion – some commissioners still had concerns about the proposed signage being compatible with the historic character of the landmark property.

Chair Fitzsimons reopened public hearing once again to hear from applicant to see if they were considering an amendment to the application. Mr. Pokela informed the HPC that his client would like to propose painting the signage onto the hopper and aerial walkway and not use brackets and studs to mount.

Chair Fitzsimons closed public hearing - Commission discussion – Some commissioners still had concerns about compatibility.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application with the revisions proposed (painting vs. bracket/stud mount).

MOTION: Chair Fitzsimons made a motion the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1700081, 610 West Main and 602 West Morgan Streets – Signs and Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing signage on a landmark property.
The signage as presented in the application including the lettering is to be installed as proposed in the application except that it will be painted to clearly show graphics on the bridge will be on the west face instead of the east face.
- A rooftop hopper will have a circular wall sign painted on its face.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed signage is consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and is consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1700081, 610 West Main and 602 West Morgan Streets – Signs and Modifications with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA and as will be amended in regards to the graphics to clearly show graphics on the bridge will be on the west face instead of the east face.
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein. (Fitzsimons, Kreger 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 4-2 (DeBerry, Jordan voted no)

- b. **Case COA1700077 – 104 West Parrish Street – Public Art** – The applicant is seeking retroactive approval for a temporary art exhibit attached to the masonry of a landmark structure. The exhibit was removed in December 2017.

Staff Report: Ms. Smith asked for a continuance of the case due to the applicate having to leave to attend a mandatory training.

Motion: Move to continue to February meeting.

ACTION: Approved 8-0

VII. Old Business – None

VIII. New Business

a. COA Administrative Updates - None

b. Announcements and Concerns

Vacancies - One At-Large open at this time. Several candidates are under consideration; Decision on candidate will be made at the end of January.

c. Election of Officers

- **Election of Chair**

Motion: Nominate Mr. Jordan as Chair (Fitzsimons, DeBerry 2nd)

Action: Motion carried, 8-0

- **Election of Vice Chair**

Motion: Nominate Mr. DeBerry continue as Vice Chair (Fitzsimons, Waiters 2nd)

Action: Motion carried, 8-0

IX. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 11:30 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Terri Elliott, Clerk

Durham Historic Preservation Commission